

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

1st Draft

ACDA review(s) completed.

US/BP/43
April 3, 1960

25X1A9A

TO: Mr. Eaton
FROM: Robert E. Matteson
SUBJECT: Draft Comparison of the 1955 Soviet Plan
and the 1960 Western Plan

In accordance with your request on Friday, I have taken the 1955 Soviet plan and made those changes in it that would tend to make it correspond more closely to the sense of the 1960 Western plan. Underlined words indicate what I have added; parentheses what I have subtracted.

First Stage (- Measures to be Taken in 1956)

The following measures to be taken in 1960 or by _____ (1956):

1. (a) The States Parties to the treaty shall pledge themselves as a first step towards the reduction of armaments and armed forces not to increase their armed forces and conventional armaments above the level obtaining on 31 December 1959 (1954).

((b) They shall also pledge themselves, so long as there is satisfactory verification and conditions warrant it, not to increase their appropriations for armed forces and armaments including atomic weapons, above the level of the expenditures effected for those purposes during the year ending 31 December 1959 or _____ (1954).) /Note: This would be omitted as not consonant with Western plan even if possible amendatory language indicated is included./

(c) The above-mentioned measure(s) shall be carried out if possible within two months of the entry into force of the treaty.

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

-2-

(d) The U.S., USSR, Communist China, U.K., and France shall furnish the International (UN) Disarmament Organization (Commission), within one month after entry into force of the treaty, full official figures of their armed forces, conventional armaments and expenditures for military requirements.

2. (a) An agreed level shall be established to which armed forces of all States in excess of that level should be reduced, in order that no State may possess armed forces capable of constituting a serious threat to international peace. A substantial reduction shall be effected in the armed forces of the United States, the USSR, Communist China, the U.K., and France. To these ends the above-mentioned 5 Powers shall undertake to reduce under effective control the strength of their armed forces so that they do not exceed the following figures:

US	-	2,100,000	(1 - 1.5)
USSR	-	2,100,000	(1 - 1.5)
Red China	-	2,100,000	(1 - 1.5)
UK	-		(.650)
France	-		(.650)

(b) The 5 Powers shall pledge themselves also to reduce their conventional armaments correspondingly under effective control.

(c) The above-mentioned 5 Powers shall in the course of one year carry out under effective control (effect) a reduction in their armed forces and conventional armaments of 50% of the difference between the level of their armed forces and armaments obtaining on 31 December 1959 (1954) and the reduced level of the armed forces and armaments of each of these states established in accordance with the pledges made by them as set forth hereinabove.

((d) Appropriations by States for armed forces and conventional armaments shall be reduced correspondingly under conditions of satisfactory verification.) /Note: This is outside Western plan even if possible amendatory language is included./

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

-3-

3. (a) There shall be convened, not later than during the first half of 1961 (1956), a world conference on the general reduction of armaments and the control (prohibition) of atomic weapons, Note: The 1955 Soviet plan says "prohibition of atomic weapons" -- but the same 1955 plan points out that it is impossible to verify their prohibition. "Control of atomic weapons" as used in this paper by me means: (1) stopping the production of such weapons out of new fissile material, i.e. the cut-off; (2) reduction of existing stocks of fissile material for weapons purposes; (3) controlling spread of nuclear weapons to other countries. 7 to be attended by States both Members and non-Members of the UN, with a view to determining the size of the reduction of the armaments and armed forces of the other States and to controlling (prohibiting) atomic weapons.

(b) The strength of the armed forces which other States shall be authorized to retain, shall in all cases be appreciably lower than the levels established for the 5 states mentioned in 2.a. above (permanent members of the Security Council). Note: This phrasing by the USSR would exclude Red China from having an armed force as high as the permanent members of the Security Council. That the Soviet did not mean this is shown by the states and their force levels referred to in "2.a." above. 7

(c) The size of the reduction in the armaments of States, including the 5 states referred to in 2.a. (those of the permanent members of the Security Council) shall be established on the basis of simple agreed criteria, including demographic, geographic, economic, and political factors, with a view to the strengthening of world peace and international security and the diminution of the threat of aggression.

4. Note: No. 4 of the 1955 Soviet Plan refers to the suspension of nuclear tests which subject is not within the 10 Nation current terms of reference. It has therefore been omitted from this paper. 7

(5. Simultaneously with the initiation of measures to effect the first half of the agreed reduction of the armaments and armed forces of the 5 Powers to the prescribed levels and

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

-4-

before the entry into force of the agreement on the control (complete prohibition) of atomic weapons, States shall solemnly pledge themselves not to use nuclear weapons if an armed attack has not placed the party in a situation of individual or collective self-defense (which they shall regard as prohibited to them. Exceptions to this rule may be permitted for purposes of defense against aggression, when a decision to that effect is taken by the Security Council).)
/Note: The underlined is 1957 agreed Western language but not in present Western plan./

(6. (a) States possessing military, naval, and air bases in the territories of other states shall pledge themselves to indicate which bases they will liquidate in 1960 or by (liquidate such bases). /Note: (a) If the U.S. is getting out of Morocco, it can designate this base. (b) At the same time the USSR can be put on the defensive by pointing out that the USSR has bases in East Europe -- perhaps even in North Korea and China, depending on the definition of bases. (c) U.S. foreign bases from a military standpoint today may do little more than complicate a Soviet attack pattern. If this is so -- the U.S. might sometime consider seriously the Soviet 1958 proposal relating bases to missiles and outer space. (d) Because bases are not mentioned in the present Western plan, the suggestion is to omit 6.a. and b./

(b) The question of the bases designated to be liquidated during the first stage shall be dealt with by supplementary agreement.)

- - - - -

The carrying out of these measures must promote the strengthening of the requisite confidence between States and facilitate the execution of the measures for the reduction of armaments and the control (prohibition) of atomic weapons envisaged for the second stage. /Note: It should be noted that this concluding paragraph of Stage I in the 1955 Soviet plan might be interpreted as tantamount to requiring "political progress" before moving on to Stage II./

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

-5-

Second Stage (- Measures to be Taken in 1957)

The following measures shall be taken (in 1957) after the implementation of Stage I:

1. The production of atomic and hydrogen weapons shall be discontinued immediately under effective control but with allowance for reconstitution of the existing stockpile (and budgetary appropriations of States for military requirements shall be reduced correspondingly under satisfactory verification). [Note: Latter part is outside Western plan. Possible amendatory language, however, is indicated.]

2. (a) The U.S., USSR, Red China, U.K., and France shall, in the course of one year, reduce their armed forces and armaments by the remaining 50% of the difference between the level of the armed forces and armaments of each of those 5 States obtaining on 31 December 1959 (1954) and the reduced level of the armed forces and armaments of each of these States established in accordance with the pledges made by them under the convention. (These States shall correspondingly reduce their appropriations for armed forces and conventional armaments.) [Note: Last sentence is outside Western plan.]

(b) During this stage, measures with a view to the reduction of the armaments and armed forces of other governments to the extent established for them at the world conference shall also be completed.

3. ((a) After the reduction of armed forces and conventional armaments has been carried out to the extent of 75% of the total reduction laid down in the convention, a (complete) prohibition on the use of atomic, hydrogen, and other weapons of mass destruction as defined in paragraph 5 of Stage I shall come into effect.) The control (elimination) [Note: See para. 3.a. of Stage I.] of (such) weapons of mass destruction in (from) the armaments of States and the substantial transfers of weapons-grade nuclear material to peaceful uses (their destruction) shall begin simultaneously with the final 25% of the agreed reductions of armed forces and conventional armaments; and both these processes shall be completed within the time-limits in

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

-6-

1961 or by ____ (1957). All new atomic materials shall thereafter be used exclusively for peaceful purposes.

((b) States shall pledge themselves to promote extensive international co-operation in the peaceful uses of atomic energy. This co-operation shall include the free exchange of information concerning the use of atomic energy in industry, agriculture and medicine and in other branches of economic and scientific activity. In this connection, special attention shall be given to assistance to economically underdeveloped countries. Such assistance shall not be subordinated to any demands of a political or military nature.)

((c) States shall endeavor to devote a portion of the savings achieved through world-wide disarmament and the control (elimination) of nuclear weapons to the extensive use of atomic energy for peaceful purposes.)

(4. Measures for the further liquidation of (all) foreign military, naval, and air bases on the territories of other States shall be completed.)

Stage III

1. On the completion of all the measures enumerated above, it would be desirable that the Powers should further reduce their armaments and armed forces under effective control to the levels strictly necessary for the maintenance of internal security and the fulfillment of the obligations of signatory states under the terms of the UN Charter.

(2. The question of the obligations of China, as one of the permanent members of the Security Council, under the convention of the reduction of armaments and the prohibition of atomic, hydrogen, and other weapons of mass destruction shall be the subject of consideration in which the People's Republic of China shall participate.) Note: This is omitted since it is taken care of in I.3.(b) above.⁷

Note: Added on as a separate piece of paper to the 1955 Soviet Stages I and II is a paper titled "Concerning International Control Over the Reduction of Armaments and

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

-7-

the Prohibition of Atomic Weapons." The first six paragraphs of this are concerned with general statements about the "great importance and the necessity of instituting effective international control" over the execution of the obligations under the treaty, but notes that "the requisite conditions for the institution of a control system which would enjoy the confidence of all States and would fully meet the requirements of international security do not at present exist." Paragraph 7 is the well-known paragraph on the impossibility of verifying existence of all stocks of nuclear weapons. Paragraphs 8-12 deal with surprise attack. All 12 paragraphs are a preamble to the following four paragraphs on the international control organ.⁷

International Control Organ

In view of the foregoing, the General Assembly institutes an international control organ having the following rights and powers:

1. During the first stage of execution of the measures for the reduction of armaments and the control (prohibition) of atomic weapons,

(a) in order to prevent a surprise attack by one State upon another, the international control organ shall establish on the territory of all the States concerned, on a basis of reciprocity, control posts at large ports, at railway junctions, on main motor highways and in aerodromes; aerial inspection, overlapping radar, mobile ground teams, etc. The function of these posts and such other measures shall be to ensure that no dangerous concentration of military land forces or of air or naval forces takes place.

(b) the international control organ shall have the right to require from States any necessary information on the execution of measures for the reduction of armaments and armed forces.

(c) the control organ shall have unimpeded access to records relating to the budgetary appropriations of States for military purposes, including all decisions of their legislative and executive organs on the subject. States

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~

-8-

shall periodically, within specified time-limits, furnish the control organ with information on the execution of the measures provided for in the convention (treaty).

2. During the second stage of execution of measures for the reduction of armaments and the prohibition of atomic weapons:

The carrying out of (the measures provided for in the Declaration set forth above and of) the measures for the reduction of armaments and armed forces and the control (prohibition) of atomic and hydrogen weapons envisaged for the first stage will create the requisite atmosphere of confidence between States, thereby ensuring the necessary conditions for the extension of the functions of the international control organ. [Note: The word "extension" implies the control organ has already been set up in Stage I -- and thus conforms with Western plan.]

In these circumstances, the international control organ shall have the following rights and powers:

(a) To exercise supervision, including inspection on a continuing basis, to the extent necessary to ensure implementation of the convention by all States. In the discharge of these functions, the international control organ shall also have the right to require from States any necessary information on the execution of measures for the reduction of armaments and armed forces.

Staff recruited to carry out the work of inspection shall be selected on an international basis.

(b) To have in all States signatories to the convention its own permanent staff of inspectors, having unimpeded access at all times, within the limits of the supervisory functions they exercise, to all objects of control.

In order to prevent a surprise attack by one State upon another, the international control organ shall in particular have on the territory of all the States concerned, on a basis of reciprocity, control posts at large ports, at

CONFIDENTIAL

-9-

railway junctions, on main motor highways and in aerodromes and other measures indicated in 1.a.

(c) The control organ shall have unimpeded access to records relating to the budgetary appropriations of States for military purposes, including all decisions of their legislative and executive organs on the subject. States shall periodically, within specific time-limits furnish the control organ with information on the execution of the measures provided for in the convention (treaty).

3. The control organ shall make recommendations to the Security Council on measures of prevention and suppression with regard to States infringing the convention on the reduction of armaments and the control (prohibition) of atomic weapons.

4. The functions and powers of the permanent international control organ shall be determined on the basis of the foregoing principles, and appropriate directions shall be prepared for this purpose.

- - - - -

Note: (1) To the above 1955 Soviet plan as amended would have to be added the items in the 1960 Western plan not there included: outer space; missiles; international organ for preserving peace.

(2) Finally, the 1956, 1957, 1958 Soviet proposals on "partial measures" are also fruitful areas of exploration -- particularly on the control organ, surprise attack zones, and missiles and outer space. It is recommended that the next exercise be to put all Soviet plans for partial measures together in one paper -- using as far as possible Soviet language but following a Western format.7

~~CONFIDENTIAL~~